

AN ANALYSIS OF NON-ENGLISH STUDENTS' UNDERSTANDING IN USING PRONOUNS: ERROR PRONOUNS

Exnasia Retno Palupi Handayani, Cenderato

STAKat Negeri Pontianak

exnasiapalupi@gmail.com, cenderato67@gmail.com

Submitted: 2023-02-28

Accepted: 2023-03-12

Abstract: This study was to investigate the non – English students' errors in using pronouns at STAKat Negeri Pontianak. Pronouns as a part of grammar need to be acquired by the students who still didn't realize the importance of grammar in English. The goal was to design teaching English materials, especially about pronouns, that easily to be understood by the students. The participants of this research were 40 students of seconds' semester in academic year 2022. This research used descriptive research to gather the information and analyzed the result of the test. The result of the data gathered from the test that was given to the students through *Google Form*. Based on the analysis, 46.02% of the students still made errors in using pronouns. There were 4.4% errors were found in the used of subjective pronouns, 13.90% errors were found in the used of objective pronouns, 12.81% errors were found in the used of possessive pronouns, and 16.56% errors were found in the used of reflexive pronouns. The lowest errors were found in the used of subjective pronouns, and the highest error was found in the used of reflexive pronouns. Through the result of the study, the lectures could design interesting materials that increase the students' interest in learning grammar.

Keywords: correct pronouns, errors pronouns, non-English students, understanding

Introduction

English is chosen as lingua franca. It means that all people in the world learn this language to build good communication between one and others. The use of English as a global lingua franca has given rise to new challenges and approaches in our understanding of language and communication (Baker, 2015). The English learners must master all skills in language, namely speaking, reading, listening, and writing in order to understand the language.

In mastering all of those language skills cannot be separated from the comprehension of grammar, especially when the learners are learning speaking and writing. Speaking or writing without knowing the grammar of language also is nothing (Siska, 2020). When the people speak, they are not only conveying the meaning of the language or the information to others, but they also need to pay attention to the word order and also grammar used. Grammar refers to the structural or organizing principles of language that concerned with the grammatical relations between elements of a construction (Howard, 2013). De Capua (2010) defines the grammar is a set of rulers, often seen as arbitrary or unrealistic, is only one narrow view of grammar. While Harmer (2006) defines grammar as the description of the ways in which words can change their forms and can be combined into sentence in that language. Since grammar is about the word construction and form, it

brings difficulties to the second language or foreign language learners because the English grammar and the Indonesian grammar are quite different.

It also happens in STAKat Negeri Pontianak, the students have difficulty in learning grammar since they don't use English in daily life. In line with Muftah and Galea (2013) states that in the EFL (English as a foreign language) context, knowledge of grammar is considered to be the most crucial and difficult part for non-native learners to master properly. Therefore, many of the students still made an error. Corder in Khadijah (2006), claims that, the causes or error they are: the first is mother tongue interference, the second is over generalization, and the last is error encouraged by teaching material or method. Therefore, the students' errors must be measured so that the lecturer could choose the right decision in teaching the students.

Since grammar rule is one of the aspects in learning English as a foreign language, the learners must accustom to use the rules in order to master the language, such as using the tenses that we do not used in Indonesian. The student's confusion caused a mistake or an error occurs in learning grammar. Therefore, we have to make sure that all of the learners learn about all aspects of grammar, including in using personal pronouns. Pronouns are a word that can be shorted to be noun phrase (Payne, 2011). It is part of speech that is included as a component of grammar. It takes important role in grammar that cannot be skipped in learning English. Without pronouns we have to repeat the noun to make the right sentence with the right meaning for several times. Therefore, it will be impractical when are talking to other or we are writing a sentence. It could cause confusion both of the speaker and the listener or the writer and the reader. The use of personal pronouns is central to face-to-face interaction (Kuo, 1999) it means that pronouns could be used directly to connect the pronouns. By using the right pronouns could reduce the ambiguity and confusion about the meaning of the language and also the given information.

Nelson (2001:57) states: The personal pronoun exhibit contrasts for person (first person, second person, or third person), number (singular or plural), and case (subjective or objective). In addition, the third person singular pronouns he/she/it exhibit a contrast for gender (masculine, feminine or non-personal). While Kaufman (2021: 10) states that a pronoun is a word that takes the place of a noun. English pronouns and Indonesian pronouns are different, In Indonesia, the word "dia", "mereka", "saya", "kami" can be used in all of part of sentences. They can be used for subject, possessive adjectives, object, possessive pronouns and also noun. However, in English pronouns are categorized into its function, they are subject pronouns, object pronouns, possessive pronouns, and reflexive pronouns. Subjective pronouns are used when the pronoun is the subject and rename the subject. Objective pronouns are used when the pronoun is object. Possessive

pronoun is a pronoun that is used to express ownership or possession. Reflexive pronoun is used for the object of a verb when it refers to the same noun as the subject of that verb. The use of personal pronouns can be seen in this table.

Table1. Types of Pronouns

Person	Number	Subjective pronouns	Objective Pronouns	Possessive Pronouns	Reflexive Pronouns
1 st Person	Singular	I	Me	Mine	Myself
	Plural	We	Us	Ours	Ourselves
2 nd Person	Singular	You	You	Yours	Yourself
	Plural	You	You	Yours	Yourselves
3 rd Person	Singular	She	Her	Hers	Herself
		He	Him	His	Himself
		It	It	Its	Itself
	Plural	They	Them	Their	Themselves

In his research (Nokas, 2021) claimed that the students found difficulties in using personal pronoun in English due to interference of Indonesian language as their first language. In line with Nokas (2021) found that the students still have difficulties in using personal pronouns when they write a recount text based on their experience. From the previous research we can see that many students still make errors in using pronouns. It also happens in STAKat Negeri Pontianak. Since, the students still confuse in choosing the right grammar, it can be assumed that they also still confuse in choosing the right pronouns. The students still made a mistake when they have to use the pronouns in speaking or writing. Therefore, this research is conducted to know the personal mistakes or errors that are made by the students. If the previous research focus on the difficulties in using personal pronouns, this research analyzed the mistakes and the errors made by the students at STAKat Negeri Pontianak in using pronouns. The result of this research will be used as reference for the lecturer to find the most suitable approach to teach the English language in the classroom and design the interesting materials for the students.

Research Method

The method applied in this research is descriptive method. Descriptive method is an effective way to obtain information used in devising hypotheses and proposing associations. According to Kumar (2011) A descriptive study attempts systematically to describe a situation, problem, phenomenon, service or program, or provides information about, say, the living conditions of a community, or describes attitudes towards an issue. The data showed in this research described the result of the phenomena that happens in the place of this study.

This Research was conducted at STAKat Negeri Pontianak. The object of the research were 40 students of the first semester in academic year 2022, PKK 3 Class. The students' study program is Catholic education, so they are not familiar with English.

The instrument used to collect the data was giving test about personal pronoun. The students filled in the blank to answer the questions. The researcher gave the test by using *Google Form* to the students and collected the result. After that, the researcher identified the errors made by the students through the questions. The errors were classified into the type of pronouns. At last, the researcher identified the errors made and categorized into percentage.

Finding and Discussion

The findings and discussions were presented to answer the research questions about the error analysis in using pronouns for non-English students' The result of the students' test was checked and classified into the table below.

Table 2. The Error Pronouns

Pronouns	Correct	Errors
Subjective	22.25%	2,75%
Objective	11.1%	13.90%
Possessive	12.19%	12.81%
Reflexive	8.44%	16.56%
Total	53.98%	46.02%

Feder (2002) stated that pronouns are one of the basic grammars that should be mastered by the students. Therefore, the students' comprehension in using pronouns must be noticed by the lecturer. However, the data showed the significance error in using pronouns made by the students. Pronouns actually used to avoid repetition of a word in a sentence by keep the meaning of the sentences could delivered to the reader. In this case, the relationship between pronouns and its antecedent should be clearly established so that no doubt about the meaning of the pronoun exists. The learner could use the pronouns clearly and professionally as what they have learned in the classroom. However, the fact showed that many students still had difficulties in using the pronouns. The confusion still emerged and caused errors. From the test, there were 46.02% students wrote error answers in all types of pronouns and 53.98% write the correct answer. The level of errors was different in each type. The higher errors were found in Reflexive pronouns was 16.56% and the correct answer was 8.44%, the error of Objective pronouns was 13.90% and the correct answer was 11.1%, Possessive Pronouns error was 12.81% and the correct answer was 12.91, and the last was subjective pronouns error was 2.75%, and the correct answer was 22.25%.

Table 3. The Error Classification

Pronouns	Correct answer	(%)	Wrong answer	(%)	Average/type (%)	
					correct	wrong
Subjective						
1. Q1	37	92.5%	3	7.5%	95.6%	4.4%
2. Q2	40	100%	0	0%		
3. Q3	40	100%	0	0%		
4. Q4	36	90%	4	10%		
Objective						
1. Q5	9	22.5%	31	77.5%	44.5%	55.5%
2. Q6	11	27.5%	29	72.5%		
3. Q7	23	57.5%	17	42.5%		
4. Q8	28	70%	12	30%		
Possessive						
1. Q9	10	25%	30	75%	48.7%	51.3%
2. Q10	24	60%	16	40%		
3. Q11	26	65%	14	35%		
4. Q12	18	45%	22	55%		
Reflexive						
1. Q13	14	35%	26	65%	33.7%	66.3%
2. Q14	15	37.5%	25	62.5%		
3. Q15	12	30%	28	70%		
4. Q16	13	32.5%	27	67.5%		

Subjective Pronouns

The table 1 showed good result of the students' understanding about subjective pronouns. The students got 95.6% of correct answers and the error in using pronouns for about 4.4%. It showed highest correct answer and the lowest error compared to others types of pronouns. The error classification from table 2 showed the data from 4 questions about subjective pronouns, two numbers were correct and two numbers were error.

Table 4. Subjective Pronouns

Question	Correct Answer
Q1	<u>Johnny and Jane</u> are friends. <u>They</u> are playing together.
Q2	<u>I</u> have to go to school. <u>I</u> always wake up early in the morning
Q3	<u>Deo</u> plays a day long. <u>He</u> does not help to paint the fence
Q4	I saw <u>Diane</u> yesterday. <u>She</u> was standing under the tree.

From the example Q1 “Johny and Jane” can be replaced by “they” to avoid the repetition. However, three students answered by using “them” to replaced “Johny and Jane”. While Q4, the word “Diane” must be replaced by “she”, however the students still made error by replacing using “her”. Both of the errors in this type used objective pronouns to answer the questions.

Objective Pronouns

The data showed there were 44.5% correct answers by the students and 55.5% errors made by the students in doing the objective pronouns test. This type of pronouns was the second highest score of error. Errors were found from four number of questions. There were 31 errors found in number Q5, 29 errors for number Q6, 17 errors for number Q7, and 12 errors for number Q8.

Table 5. Objective Pronouns

Question	Correct Answer
Q1	<u>We</u> were sorry and ashamed of <u>us</u> for causing trouble.
Q2	If <u>they</u> want to come, give it to <u>them</u> as invitation.
Q3	<u>Danny</u> is my best friend. I know <u>him</u> so well.
Q4	The nurse is <u>my sister</u> . So don't disturb <u>her</u> .

The word “We” in Q5 must be replaced by “us” as the objective pronouns, however 31 students caused errors by replacing the word “we” using the word “ourselves and we”. The data showed 27 students answered using reflexive pronouns and 4 students answered using subjective pronouns for this question. For questions number Q6, the word “they” can be replaced by using the word “them” as objective pronouns. However, 29 students still replaced the word “they” with the word “they and themselves”. The data showed 13 students answered using reflexives pronounce and 16 students used subjective pronouns. Questions Q7. the word “Danny” must be replaced by “him”, however 8 out of 17 students used subjective pronouns, and 9 students used possessive pronouns. The last question Q8. the word “my sister” must be replaced by “her” but 12 students still had different answers, 6 students used subjective pronouns and 6 students used possessive pronouns in answering the test.

Possessive Pronouns

There were 48.7% of correct answer and 51.3% the students' made errors in doing the possessive pronouns test. This type of pronouns showed the third high score of error and an error was identified from each number of questions.

Table 6. Possessive Pronouns

Question	Correct Answer
Q9	Has <u>John</u> told you about <u>his</u> getting married?
Q10	<u>The house</u> had a wonderful pool of <u>its</u> own.
Q11	I know <u>Mr. Tom</u> , but I don't know <u>his</u> wife.
Q12	Do you think <u>most people</u> happy in <u>their</u> jobs?

Questions number 9 showed 30 errors and 21 of them answered the question using subjective pronoun, and 9 of them using reflexive pronouns. The word "John" must be replaced by "his" to show the possessive pronouns, however the students still answered using "he and himself". The questions number Q10 showed 16 errors, 10 out of 16 showed the students used subjective pronouns and 6 students used reflexive pronouns. The word "the house" must be replaced by "its", however the students still answered "it and itself". The questions number Q11. showed 14 errors were made by the students and all of them used subjective pronoun. The word "Mr. Tom" must be replaced by "his", but the students used "he". The last questions Q12, showed 22 errors using objective pronouns. The word "most people" must be replaced by "their", however, the students still used "they and them".

Reflexive Pronouns

The result of reflexive pronouns showed the highest errors made by the students in using pronouns. The students correct answer wrote by the students was 33.7% and the error answer was 66.3% in doing this test. Most of the students still confuse to differentiate reflexive pronouns and objective pronouns.

Table 7. Reflexive Pronouns

Question	Correct Answer
Q13	<u>She</u> can cook by <u>herself</u> .
Q14	<u>I</u> can finish it by <u>myself</u> .
Q15	<u>They</u> do the project by <u>themselves</u> in this month.
Q16	<u>We</u> could solve this problem by <u>ourselves</u> .

The question Q13. The word “she” must be replaced by “herself” to show the reflexive pronouns. However, 12 students out of 22 students used subjective pronouns, and 10 students used objective pronouns. The students still replaced the word “she” with “she and her”. The question number Q14 showed 16 students used objective pronouns and 9 of them used subjective pronouns. The word “I” must be replaced by “myself” but the students still replaced by using the word “I and Mine”. The Question number Q15 showed 27 students used subjective pronouns and 1 student used possessive pronouns. The word “they” must be replaced by “themselves” but the students still used the word “they and them”. The last question number Q16. The word “We” must be replaced by “ourselves”. However, the students still replaced by using the word “our and we”. The data showed 23 students used objective pronouns and 4 students used subjective pronouns.

From the discussion above we could see that the communication between the writer and the reader is very important. The reader must understand the meaning conveyed by the reader. The last was addition the possible source of the error was communication strategies, where it was related to students’ learning style or the students’ way to get the message (Brown, 2000)

Conclusion

From the shown data from the table can be concluded that the students still made big errors in using pronouns. There were 46.02% errors was found as the result of the test and 53.98% was correct. From given test, only two questions about subjective pronouns were correct, the others were error. The lowest errors found in using the subjective pronouns that was 4.4% of errors, and the highest errors was found in using reflexive pronouns, that was 16.56% of errors. The other two pronouns had the medium errors, for objective pronouns had 13.90% of errors and the possessive pronouns has 12.81% of errors. The errors caused by the misconception of students about the use of pronouns in each type. The research showed the students clear enough in using subjective pronouns, but they still have difficulties in categorizing the objective, possessive, and reflexive pronouns.

References

- Baker, Will. (2015). *Culture and Identity through English as a Lingua Franca*. Boston: Walter de Gruyter, Inc.
- Brown, D. H. (2000). *Principle of language learning and teaching (4th ed.)*. New York: Pearson Education, Inc.
- De Capua, A. (2010). *Grammar for teachers: A guide to American English for native and non-native speakers* (Digitally print version). Springer.
- Feder, M. (2002). *Free English lessons from the ESL resource center*. Retrieved from <https://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&cad=rja&uact=8&ved=0ahUKEwiXmtWE6cXSAhWHro8KHfdbBqQQFggZMAA&url=http%3A%2F%2Flanguagelesson.com%2Fsep2013%.pdf&usg=AFQjCNEmvbLs111Zxc1TnSg5z55LUiBAGg&sig2=39YvkbFtZ5x6ezWrn3iisg>
- Harmer, J. (2006). *The practice of English language teaching (3. ed., completely rev. and updated, 8. impr.)*. New York: Longman.
- Howard, Jacson. (2013). *Grammar and Meaning*. Boston: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group.
- Kaufman, Lester., Jane Straus. (2021). *The blue book of grammar and punctuation*. St. Hoboken: Jossey Bass
- Kumar, R. *Research Methodology: A Step-by-Step Guide for Beginners*. Sage Publications: 3rd Ed. Pp-334.
- Khadijah. (2006). *Result on Personal Pronouns, a case study in first year of MTS Nurul Falah Gunung Sindur Bogor*. Retrieved from <https://repository.uinjkt.ac.id/dspace/bitstream/>
- Kuo, Chih Hua. (1999). *The Use of Personal Pronouns: Role Relationships in Scientific Journal Articles*. ESP: Volume 18, issue 2. Retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ577543>
- Muftah, M & Galea. (2013). Error analysis of present simple tense in the interlanguage of adult Arab English language learners. *English language teaching*, 6(2), 146-154. Retrieved from <https://www.google.co.id/url?sa=t&rct=j&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.ccsenet.org%2Fjournal%2Findex.php%2Felt%2Farticle%2Fdownload%2F23822%2F15120&usg=AFQjCNGiqPsdwlrOTZN2KAHrq6gYGPmw&sig2=fBMImrbCF2dk6Zu8Pc0LVw&bvm=bv.149093890,d.dGo>
- Nelson, G. (2001). *English: An essential grammar*. London: Routledge.
- Nokas, Darni Nopi. (2021). *Students' Ability in Using Pronouns in English*. *Journal of Language Teaching and Learning*. Vol 3. No1. Retrieved from <https://ejournal.uin-malang.ac.id/index.php/jetle/article/viewFile/13129/pdf>
- Payne. T.E. (2011). *Understanding English grammar a linguistic introduction*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

- Saputra, Heru, dkk. (2018). *An Error Analysis on the Use of Personal Pronouns in Descriptive Writing*. Jambi Language Teaching Journal Volume 3 No 2, 84-100. Retrieved from <https://online-journal.unja.ac.id/jelt/article/view/7171>
- Siska, S. (2020). Students' difficulties in using personal pronouns: A case study at the eight grade of SMPN Sakra in the academic year 2018-2019. <http://eprints.unram.ac.id/16420/>